COSMOLOGY: ORIGIN & STRUCTURES ON COSMOLOGICAL VELOCITY FIELDS

Sous la direction de: Jean-Michel Alimi

En collaboration avec: Pier-Stefano Corasaniti, Yann Rasera, Irène Balmès, Vincent Reverdy, Linda Blot



PARIS 7



jeudi 17 janvier 2013

Agenda

- I. Introduction
- II. Large-scale cosmological velocity fields
- III.Statistical interpretation of high velocity cosmic flows
- IV.Large-scale asymmetry: origin of high velocity cosmic flows
- V. Spatial distribution of high velocity cosmic flowsVI.Bullet Cluster: A challenge to standard cosmology?VII.Conclusion

I.INTRODUCTION

Discovery of a Dark Sector
 Dark Energy - Structure formation
 N-body simulations
 Cosmological velocity fields



DISCOVERY OF A DARK SECTOR

- The Universe is a dynamical physical system.
- Cosmic expansion is accelerated:
 - This acceleration is driven by an unknown form of energy.
 - What is the amount of Dark Energy?
- Supernovae la, Cosmic Microwave Background, Baryonic Acoustic Oscillations.



07/12/12

DARK ENERGY - STRUCTURE FORMATION

- What is the nature of Dark Energy?
 - Numerous concurrent Dark Energy models
- How can we distinguish various Dark Energy models?
- Solution: use of structure formation and gravitational non-linear clustering.
 - What can we learn on Dark Energy from structure formation?
 - Conversely, what is the impact of Dark Energy on structure formation?

STRUCTURE FORMATION

- Structure formation and gravitational clustering are nonlinear processes.
- No analytic theories to fully describe the gravitational collapse from a linear to a non-linear phase, which is very important to understand structure formation:
 - Unavoidable use of the numerical tool.
- How should we proceed to perform numerical simulations of structure formation in Dark Energy models?
 - N-body simulations to follow gravitational clustering in realistic (i.e. in agreement with SNIa, CMB...) cosmological models.

- «Not too high» number of bodies: the main difficult part is the resolution of the Vlasov-Poisson equations.
- The DEUS consortium:
 - An highly scalable application called AMADEUS emcompassing the whole simulation chain.
 - Initial conditions: realistic models.
 - Gravity solver (Vlasov-Poisson solver) RAMSES-DEUS.
 - Post-processing (Slicing, Friends-of-Friends structure detection, filing of generated data...).

07/12/12

- The PM method in a nutshell:
 - Compute the mass density ρ on the mesh using an interpolation scheme from the position of particles.



- 2. Compute the potential ϕ on the **mesh** using the field equation.
- 3. Compute the acceleration on the **mesh**.
- 4. Compute each **particle** acceleration using the inverse interpolation scheme used in step 1.
- 5. Update each **particle** velocity and position check energy conservation equation modify the time-step.

- The PM method in a nutshell:
 - Compute the mass density ρ on the mesh using an interpolation scheme from the position of particles.



- 2. Compute the potential ϕ on the **mesh** using the field equation.
- 3. Compute the acceleration on the **mesh**.
- 4. Compute each **particle** acceleration using the inverse interpolation scheme used in step 1.
- 5. Update each **particle** velocity and position check energy conservation equation modify the time-step.

Set of 31 cosmological simulations covering a large range of science topics (scales and cosmological models):

Boxlength (h ⁻¹ Mpc)	Resolution (h ⁻¹ kpc)	Mass resol. (h⁻¹ M⊚)	Number of particles	Initial redshift	Cosmological model	Computer (# of cores)
162	2.5	2.10 ⁹	512 ³	90	Λ , SU, RP	Titane (64)
162	2.5	2.5.10 ⁸	1024 ³	130	Λ , SU, RP	BlueGene/P (4096)
648	20	1.5.1011	512 ³	55	Λ , SU, RP	_
648	10	1.7.10 ¹⁰	1024 ³	90	Λ , SU, RP	BlueGene/P (4096)
648	5	2.10 ⁹	2048 ³	90	Λ , SU, RP	BlueGene/P (32768)
1296	40	10 ¹²	512 ³	40	Λ , SU, RP	-
2592	40	10 ¹²	1024 ³	55	Λ , SU, RP	BlueGene/P (4096)
2592	20	1.5.10 ¹¹	2048 ³	55	Λ , RP	BlueGene/P (24576)
5184	40	10 ¹²	2048 ³	40	Λ , RP	BlueGene/P (24576)
10368	40	10 ¹²	4096 ³	100	Λ , RP, w	Curie Thin (9504)
21000	40	10 ¹²	.8192 ³	100	Λ , RP, w	Curie Thin (76032)

jeudi 17 janvier 2013

- DEUS cosmological models:
 - Standard ΛCDM model.
 - Quintessence models:
 - Find the potential parameters:

 - Ratra-Peebles: $V_{RP}(\varphi) = \frac{\lambda^{4+\alpha_Q}}{\varphi^{\alpha_Q}}$ Supergravity: $V_{SU}(\varphi) = \frac{\lambda^{4+\alpha_Q}}{\varphi^{\alpha_Q}}$
 - Phantom model:
 - Find the equation of state: w



07/12/12

COSMOLOGICAL VELOCITY FIELDS

- Cosmological velocity fields:
 - Probe from small to large scales.
 - Sensitive to the total mass (not only the luminous baryons).
 - More sensitive to large scales than density fields.



07/12/12

COSMOLOGICAL VELOCITY FIELDS

Cosmological velocity fields:



COSMOLOGICAL VELOCITY FIELDS

Cosmological velocity fields:



VI.BULLET CLUSTER: A CHALLENGE TO STANDARD COSMOLOGY

Bullet clusters
 Occurence of bullets
 Probability of bullets



jeudi 17 janvier 2013

BULLET CLUSTERS

✤ 1E0657-56 (BC) is the most famous bullet system:

Main cluster mass 10¹⁵ h⁻¹ M_☉.

- Ratio 10:1 at z=0.296.
- The gas of the main cluster is ripped off the gravitaional potential!
- Velocity of the shock front is 4700 km/s.



Doesn't mean the dark matter velocity is so high.

Imprints of Dark Energy on structure formation

07/12/12

BULLET CLUSTERS

- Other bullet systems:
 - El Gordo (ACT-CL J0102-4915) (mass ratio 2:1 z=0.87)





 MACS J0025.4-1222 (mass ratio 1:1 z=0.586)

07/12/12

BULLET CLUSTERS

- How such galaxy cluster pairs form?
 - Mastropietro & Burkert (2008) pave the initial parameters space to understand how the gas of the main halo can be ripped of the potential (3D hydro simulation)
 - Initial conditions:
 - ▶ Initial redshift: z=0.486.
 - Mass ratios: 6:1 better than 10:1.
 - Initial relative (pairwise) velocities: 3000 km/s.
 - Careful: non-cosmological simulations.

Imprints of Dark Energy on structure formation



jeudi 17 janvier 2013

07/12/12

- Is this a problem for the standard picture of cosmology?
- Such an event can rule out an entire cosmological model!
- Use very large numerical simulations to look for the initial conditions of Mastropietro & Burkert (2008).
 - DEUS: Full Universe Run is the perfect simulation:
 - ▶ High mass resolution.
 - Large volume to get extreme events and high halo abundance.

- Distribution of v₁₂ to know if some objects may have the good initial velocity:
 - Large pairs velocity are definitely there.
 - But, the BC initial conditions require a given average mass.
- Distribution in (M,v₁₂) plane to know if some objects may match the good initial condition.



07/12/12

✤ Redshift dependence of (M,v₁₂) plane:



jeudi 17 janvier 2013

- \clubsuit Redshift dependence of (M,v₁₂) plane:
 - Due to our large statistics, two regions appear in the simulations.
 - In blue, standard BC: a cluster-subcluster
 - In red, MACS J0025.4-1222, ^(o) a cluster-cluster interact



Not a lot of BC candidates around blue lines...

Imprints of Dark Energy on structure formation

MACS J0025.4-1222

Cosmology dependence of (M,v₁₂) plane (@ z=0):



jeudi 17 janvier 2013

- Cosmology dependence of (M,v₁₂) plane (@ z=0):
 - In the Ratra-Peebles model, it is NOT possible.
 - In a phantom cosmology, it is possible (many candidates).
 - The limit case is the standard cosmology (1 candidate)...



LCDM

wCDM

PROBABILITY OF BULLETS

- Usual approach is to model the tail of the pairwise velocity PDF as a gaussian.
- However, we already know it is not!
 - Tails of distribution have something to do with Pareto function.
 - A gaussian modeling can lead to an under-(over-)estimation of the probability of occurence.
- Previous studies (Hayashi et al., Lee et al., Thompson et al.) use gaussians:
 - Their conclusions: the BC is impossible (10⁻⁹) in LCDM model.

Imprints of Dark Energy on structure formation

07/12/12

PROBABILITY OF BULLETS

- Extreme value approach:
 - Define an extremal event: choose of threshold
 - Tail of our velocity distribution is a generalized Pareto function:

$$F_{(\xi,\mu,\sigma)}(x) = 1 - \left[1 + \xi\left(\frac{x-\mu}{\sigma}\right)\right]_{+}^{-1/\delta}$$

What is the evolution of the tail index with the threshold?



PROBABILITY OF BULLETS

The tail index is close to zero (gaussian case) but not exactly zero (10⁻²).



II.LARGE SCALE COSMOLOGICAL VELOCITY FIELDS

Local Universe measurements
 Numerical catalogs
 Link with initial conditions



LOCAL UNIVERSE MEASUREMENTS

- Observational state:
 - COMPOSITE (SFI++, SBF...), 2MRS, 6dF...
- Two measured facts:
 - Non-reconvergence of the spherical mean of the velocity fields at large scales towards the CMB dipole.



Référentiel CMB $\vec{v}_{CMB} = \vec{0}$

27

LOCAL UNIVERSE MEASUREMENTS

- Two measured facts:
 - Maximum of cosmic flows at intermediate scales.
- ✤ Is this an issue for ∧CDM?
 - Is there a problem with hierarchical models?
 - Explanation with dynamical or statistical arguments?







Realistic catalog: Extrema in agreement with obs.

Linear catalog: profile in agreement with lin. prediction.



NUMERICAL CATALOGS

• Catalogs mean trend (σ_R & bulk flow):



NUMERICAL CATALOGS

• Catalogs mean trend (σ_R & bulk flow):



RMS mass fluctuation amplitude $\,\,c_{_{\rm R}}^{}$ computed on various sets

07/12/12

LINK WITH INITIAL CONDITIONS

An initial condition issue:

- Follow the evolution backward in time of each member of catalogs.
- Compute mean bulk flow renormalized by linear evolution factors.
- The bulk flow stays the same through time: it results from a linear evolution.



07/12/12

III.STATISTICAL INTERPRETATION OF A HIGH VELOCITY COSMIC FLOWS

- 1) Bulk flow prediction: 1-point pdf
- 2) Bulk flow: N-point pdf
- 3) Bulk flow linear deviation: 2-point pdf
- 4) Retrieving cosmology: 3-point pdf



- * Gaussian initial conditions in a given model: what is the probability to have a bulk flow v_1 in a sphere of radius R_1 ?
- Standard issue in the kinetic theory of gases:

$$P(\vec{v}_1)d^3\vec{v}_1 = P(v_{1,x}, v_{1,y}, v_{1,z})dv_{1,x}dv_{1,y}dv_{1,z}$$

= $P(v_{1,x})dv_{1,x}P(v_{1,y})dv_{1,y}P(v_{1,z})dv_{1,z}$

• $v_{1,j}$ is gaussian: its norm is a Maxwell-Boltzmann distribution:



• Let $\vec{V} = (\vec{v}_1, \vec{v}_2, \dots, \vec{v}_N)$ a set of bulk flows at N radii.

- What is the probability to get a particular set of bulk flows in a given cosmology C?
- Quantification of correlations between scales:

$$<\vec{v}_{k,i}\cdot\vec{v}_{k',i}>=\delta^{k,k'}\sigma_i^2$$
$$<\vec{v}_{k,i}\cdot\vec{v}_{k',j}>=\delta^{k,k'}\gamma_{i,j}\sigma_i\sigma_j$$

Gaussian initial conditions:

$$\sigma_i^2 = \frac{1}{6\pi^2} \int_0^\infty k^3 P_v(k) \hat{W}(kR_i)^2 \frac{\mathrm{d}k}{k}$$
$$\gamma_{i,j} = \frac{1}{6\pi^2 \sigma_i \sigma_j} \int_0^\infty k^3 P_v(k) \hat{W}(kR_i) \hat{W}(kR_j) \frac{\mathrm{d}k}{k}$$

07/12/12

- * Simplification: reduced variables $\vec{U}_i = \vec{V}_i / \sigma_i$.
 - For the k-th component of the bulk flow vector:

$$P(V_k \mid \mathcal{C}) = \frac{1}{(2\pi)^{N/2}\sqrt{|\mathcal{C}|}} \prod_i \left(\frac{1}{\sigma_i}\right) \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2}U_k^{\dagger} C^{-1} U_k\right)$$

with C the covariance matrix linking scales:

$$C = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & & \gamma_{j,i} \\ & \ddots & \\ \gamma_{i,j} & & 1 \end{pmatrix}$$

Independence of the x, y, z components:

$$P(\vec{V} \mid \mathcal{C}) = \frac{|C^{-1}|^{3/2}}{(2\pi)^{3N/2}} \prod_{i} \left(\frac{1}{\sigma_{i}}\right)^{3} \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2}\sum_{k=1}^{3} U_{k}^{\dagger} C^{-1} U_{k}\right)$$

07/12/12

- Quantify the norm of the bulk flow:
 - Introduce the relative angle α_{ij} between directions i and j of the bulk flow in spherical coordinates (M=C⁻¹):

$$dP(v_1, ..., v_i, ..., v_N | \mathcal{C}) = \frac{|\mathcal{C}^{-1}|^{3/2}}{(2\pi)^{3N/2}} \prod_i \left(\frac{1}{\sigma_i}\right)^3 \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2} \sum_i m_{i,i} U_i^2\right)$$
$$\times \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2} \sum_{\substack{i,j\\i\neq j}} m_{i,j} U_i U_j \cos(\alpha_{ij})\right) \times \prod_i \sigma_i^3 \sin(\theta_i) U_i^2 dU_i d\theta_i d\phi_i$$

07/12/12

- What is the probability to get a given cosmic flows profile?
 - To marginalize on the angles, we need to know the link between spherical coordinates of v_i and α_{ij}:

 $\cos \alpha_{ij} = \sin \theta_i \sin \theta_j \left(\cos \phi_i \cos \phi_j + \sin \phi_i \sin \phi_j \right) + \cos \theta_i \cos \theta_j$

• A simplification is possible under axes rotation in some cases:

	2-point pdf:	$\theta_1 = 0$	$\theta_2 = \alpha_{12}$		
		any ϕ_1	any ϕ_2		
3-poi	3-noint ndf	$\theta_1 = \phi_3 = 0$	any ϕ_1		
	S-point pui.	$\cos \alpha_{12} = \cos \theta_2$	(+circ perm)		
		$\cos \alpha_{13} = \cos \theta_3$	(+circ. periii)		
		$\cos \alpha_{23} = \sin \theta_2 \sin \theta_3 \cos \phi_2 + \cos \theta_2 \cos \theta_3$			

37

jeudi 17 janvier 2013



Proba num.

1.56%

1.17%

0.82%

What is the probability to observe a given bulk flow profile as Watkins et al.?

$$P(v_1, v_2 \mid \mathcal{C}) = \frac{2}{\pi} \frac{1}{\gamma_{1,2}} \frac{1}{\sqrt{1 - \gamma_{1,2}^2}} U_1 U_2 \exp\left(-\frac{U_1^2 + U_2^2}{2(1 - \gamma_{1,2}^2)}\right) \sinh\left(\frac{\gamma_{1,2} U_1 U_2}{1 - \gamma_{1,2}^2}\right)$$



- The probability to observe such a bulk flow is low:
 - This is a rare event in a given cosmology.
 - Coherent picture between numerical and statistical points of view.
- In all cosmological models, such observations are predicted by linear theory but are proved to be rare.
- How can we retrieve the cosmological information?

- Have to do deeper survey until a scale R₃: the scale of reconvergence to the linear prediction is a cosmological probe.
- Method: this hypothetic scale of reconvergence is varying.
- Probability of 3 bulk flows at 3 scales: 3-point pdf.
 - Strong correlation between 3 bulk flow vectors.
 - 3 relative angles: non-separable integration.
- Hypothesis: two relative angles are small.

07/12/12

* 3-point PDF: $P(v_1, v_2, v_3 | \mathcal{C}) = \frac{2\sqrt{2}}{\pi^{3/2} m_{1,2} m_{1,3}} U_2 U_3 | C^{-1} |^{3/2} \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2} \left(m_{1,1} U_1^2 + m_{2,2} U_2^2 + m_{3,3} U_3^2\right) + \frac{1}{2} \left(M U_1 U_2 + M U_2 U_3 + M U_2 + M U_2 U_3 + M U_2 + M$

× sinh $(U_1U_2m_{1,2})$ sinh $(U_1U_3m_{1,3})$ × $\mathcal{I}_0(U_2U_3m_{2,3})$ + perm. circ.

 $\sigma(16h^{-1}\mathrm{Mpc})$

41

The differential probability of reconvergence is given by: $P(v_3|v_1, v_2) = \frac{P(v_1, v_2, v_3)}{P(v_1, v_2)}$ The probability of reconvergence is given by: $Q(v_3|v_1, v_2) = \int_0^{v_3} \frac{P(v_1, v_2, u)}{P(v_1, v_2)} du$

07/12/12

- An original cosmological probe:
 - The scale of reconvergence to linear theory @ 95%.



CONCLUSIONS (SO FAR)

- Large bulk flows in apparent disagreement with linear theory at large scales: a problem for hierarchical CDM models?
- High cosmic flows come from a statistically rare event
 (~%) in agreement with the linear theory and
 consistent with numerical simulations.
- This rare feature gives birth to an original cosmological probe.

IV.LARGE-SCALE ASYMMETRY: ORIGIN OF HIGH VELOCITY COSMIC FLOWS

Qualitative approach of density field
 Quantitative approach: asymmetry index
 A characteristic scale



jeudi 17 janvier 2013

QUALITATIVE APPROACH

- Reconvergence of the bulk flow intuitively linked with an homogenization of the density field at higher scales:
 - What is the dynamical origin of the high velocity bulk flow at intermediate scales in a rare environment?
 - How to characterize the density field to find this origin?
- Bulk flow is a vector (i.e. a directional quantity):
 - For the density field, a direction can be introduced: the center of mass of a sphere.



✤ <u>Example</u>: Mollweide projection (53 h⁻¹ Mpc)







jeudi 17 janvier 2013

QUANTITATIVE APPROACH

- The center of mass approach suffers from many issues (e.g. normalisation problem).
- More accurate and efficient tool: an estimator of asymmetry of spheres (or shells).

 $F_{R}(\theta_{0},\phi_{0}) = \frac{1}{\rho_{tot}} \iint_{\mathbb{S}^{2}/2} \rho_{R}(\theta+\theta_{0},\phi+\phi_{0}) - \rho_{R}(\pi-(\theta+\theta_{0}),\pi+(\phi+\phi_{0}))d\Omega$

$$A_{R} = \max_{\phi_{0} \in [0,2\pi], \theta_{0} \in [0,2\pi]} F_{R}(\theta_{0},\phi_{0})$$

• Direction of the asymmetry A_R given by (ϕ_0, θ_0) .



 θ_0

48

07/12/12

Imprints of Dark Energy on structure formation

jeudi 17 janvier 2013

QUANTITATIVE APPROACH

- Mean of asymmetry indexes on linear (red) and realistic (blue) numerical catalogs in spheres.
- Two particular scales for the realistic catalog:
 - Depletion @ 60 h⁻¹ Mpc.
 - Bump @ 85 h⁻¹ Mpc.
- Link between this bump of asymmetry and the bump of bulk flow?



07/12/12

A CHARACTERISTIC SCALE

- Alignment between the bulk flow at 53 h⁻¹ Mpc and the asymmetry vector in shells at radius R?
 - Realistic catalog: scales between 60 and 100 h⁻¹ Mpc, peaking at 85 h⁻¹ Mpc.
 - Linear catalog: no particular scales.
- Perfect alignment of the bulk flow at 53 h⁻¹ Mpc and the asymmetry in shells at radius 85 h⁻¹ Mpc.



07/12/12

A CHARACTERISTIC SCALE

- Asymmetry integrated in spheres:
 - Scalar product of the bulk flow vector at radius R with the asymmetry in spheres of larger radius R+δR.
- The mean shift δR
 between the velocity
 and the density
 fields is:

 $\delta R=32 \pm 4.1 h^{-1} Mpc.$





V.Spatial distribution of high velocity cosmic flows

Origin of asymmetry
 Density peak reconstruction
 Distance to neighboring density peaks



ORIGIN OF ASYMMETRY

- The centers of the realistic catalog are not randomly distributed.
- What structures (voids, filaments, clusters...) can trigger such an asymmetry?
- Characterize neighbors density peaks.



07/12/12

DENSITY PEAK RECONSTRUCTION

Compute accurate density field from a set of particles using SPH smoothing:

$$\rho_i = \rho(\vec{r}_i) = m \sum_j W\left(|\vec{r}_i - \vec{r}_j|, \lambda\right)$$

* One free parameter: kernel λ .



DISTANCE TO NEIGHBORING PEAKS

- * The mean mass contained in a SPH bubble of mean density δ is: $\bar{M} = \frac{4}{3}\pi\lambda^3\bar{\rho}(1+\delta)$
- Compute separations between closest density peaks and centers of the realistic catalog:
 - Clear definition of centers of the realistic catalog.
 - What closest density peaks?
- * Second free parameter: peak height threshold $\Delta.$
- * Remaining issue: determine the (λ, Δ) parameters.

DISTANCE TO NEIGHBORING PEAKS

- * A univocal way to set the free parameters (λ, Δ) :
 - Statistical criterion on the cdf of overdensities: 1σ , 3σ , 5σ confidence levels.



jeudi 17 janvier 2013



jeudi 17 janvier 2013

5

57

DISTANCE TO NEIGHBORING PEAKS

- Variation with the kernel:
 - 1 σ density peaks: plateau
 + quick decrease.
 - 3 σ density peaks:
 gaussian (similar moments).
 - 5 σ density peaks:
 depends on the kernel.
- ♦ Whatever λ, peak height at 3 σ gives M=7.10¹⁴ h⁻¹ M_☉ at 80 h⁻¹ Mpc.

07/12/12



DISTANCE TO NEIGHBORING PEAKS

- A cluster candidate in the Zone of Avoidance (Ebeling et al. 2002, Kocevski et al. 2005)
- ♦ Ophiuchus cluster, mass 5.10¹⁴ h⁻¹ M_☉, at 80 h⁻¹ Mpc.



jeudi 17 janvier 2013

- Observations of a high velocity bulk flow at intermediate scales are due to a statistically rare event.
- The reconvergence of the bulk flow towards the linear amplitude at large scales is an new original cosmological probe.
- The dynamical origin of a high velocity bulk flow is linked with the asymmetry of the three-dimensional matter field at higher scales (~85 h⁻¹ Mpc).
- Those observers are occupying particular over-dense places at ~80 h⁻¹ Mpc from a high density peak.

07/12/12

- This presentation: cosmological velocity fields.
- Density field can give information on different aspects:
 - Power spectra.
 - Correlation functions and Haloes-Dark-Matter biases.
 - Mass functions in redshift and comoving space.
 - Covariant perturbations theory in general multi-fluids cosmology.

- Importance of efficiency to get new simulations to tackle new scientific problems:
 - Optimization of the communication scheme (BlueGene vs Bullx) of the RAMSES dynamical code.
 - Various optimization of the pFoF halo finder code.
- Fast correlation function computation methods.
- Population of Dark Matter haloes with galaxies (e.g. Markov chains).

- How can we populate Dark Matter haloes from HOD?
- Extreme value statistics:
 - What is the distribution of the most massive Dark Matter haloes at a given redshift in a given cosmology?
 - What is the distribution of the mass of the *kth*-biggest Dark Matter haloes at a given redshift in observations?



jeudi 17 janvier 2013

QUESTIONS & COMMENTS !



QUESTIONS & COMMENTS !



QUESTIONS & COMMENTS !



TOOLBOX

Toolbox:

- Malquist bias In brightness-limited survey The average measured lum. of a survey will be higher than the true one since only the brightest object can be seen at large distance.
- Octree structure at the right
- Ophiuchus:Détecté par le survey CIZA de Ebeling et Kocevski (2002-2005-2007).



66

07/12/12